

Review of Rejected Faculty Group Edits

Comment #	Chapter	Source	Comments	CDE Notes	CHSSP Recommendation
2452	10 (Gr. 6)	South Asia Faculty Group	<p>Page 211, lines 805-809:</p> <p>Current text: “Some of the statues and figurines, as well as images on the seals, show features that are all present in modern Hinduism, such as a male figure that resembles the Hindu God Shiva in a meditating posture, as well as small clay figures in the posture of the traditional Hindu greeting “namaste.”</p> <p>Suggested change: “Although not much is known about the religious practices and beliefs of the Indus Valley civilization, some form of mother goddess may have been worshipped.”</p> <p>New suggested wording:</p> <p>“Some of the terracotta figurines and narrative images on seals show motifs that were used in later South Asian religious traditions, such as female figurines that may represent fertility deities of mother goddess images. However, it is not possible to link any specific Indus figures to specific deities in later religious traditions.”</p>	This edit conflicts with another submission.	No

Rationale: Leaving the text as it is gives the false impression that there are many religious ideas in the IVC that continue into Hinduism. That, in turn, seems to imply that the IVC was some kind of early version of Hinduism. There is no way of knowing what the male figure that is referenced in the text represented to its creators. It has been suggested that it could be a god of vegetation, a ruler, or a shaman. The implication that it is associated with Siva (and, therefore with yoga) was an early idea that has now largely being discarded. In any case, it could represent some other god, if it indeed is a god. There is some continuity from the IVC onwards with respect to aspects of material culture, such as the use of bangles, but that in itself does not imply any association with Hinduism, which is a much later development. We recommend that a vetted image from the international Harappa website: <https://www.harappa.com/slideshows/embodying-indus-life> be selected to replace this contested image.

2471	10 (Gr. 6)	South Asia Faculty Group	<p>Page 212, lines 831-832:</p> <p>Current text: "There is another point of view that suggests that the language was indigenous to India and spread northward, but it is a minority position."</p> <p>Suggested change: delete sentence.</p>		No
------	---------------	-----------------------------	--	--	----

Rationale: The key reference to this question we cite is by Asko Parpola, a member of the international team of Harappa scholars:
<https://www.harappa.com/experts>

2486	10 (Gr. 6)	South Asia Faculty Group	<p>Page 213, lines 841-842:</p> <p>Current text: "The Hindu tradition is thus monistic, the idea of reality being a unitary whole."</p> <p>Suggested change: delete this sentence.</p>	This edit conflicts with another submission.	No
------	---------------	-----------------------------	--	--	----

Alternatively, the sentence can be changed to the following: "One strand of the Hindu tradition, thus, is monistic, the idea of reality being a unitary whole. Other strands of the tradition are dualistic or pluralistic."

2550	10 (Gr. 6)	South Asia Faculty Group	<p>Page 215, lines 902-903:</p> <p>Current text: "Rama, his wife Sita, and some other characters are challenged by critical moral decisions in this epic work."</p> <p>Suggested change: "Rama, his wife Sita, and some other characters are challenged by important moral decisions in this epic work."</p>	Note that the group seemed to be working off the previous September 2015 draft when it reviewed this language.	No
------	---------------	-----------------------------	--	--	----

Rationale: we did not submit this edit.

2735	11 (Gr. 7)	South Asia Faculty Group	<p>Page 265, lines 704-707:</p> <p>Current text: "Hinduism continued to evolve with the Bhakti movement, which emphasized personal expression of devotion to God, who had three aspects: Brahma, the creator, Vishnu, the protector, and Siva, the transformer."</p> <p>Suggested change: "Hinduism continued to evolve with the Bhakti movement, which emphasized personal expression of devotion to God."</p>		No
------	---------------	-----------------------------	---	--	----

The suggested edit is called for because there are Hindu religious traditions that don't practice devotion to Brahma, Visnu or Siva, as in the important case of Kabir and his followers. Also, there are a great many other divinities that are excluded by specifying only these three. Notably, the worship of goddesses is very important, as in the cases of Durga, Kali and many local goddesses at the village level.

2849	11 (Gr. 7)	South Asia Faculty Group	<p>Page 307, lines 1549-1562:</p> <p>Current text: see above.</p> <p>Suggested change: "Around 1520, Nanak (1469-1539), a religious thinker and poet of significant talent acquired a piece of land on the banks of the river Ravi, founded a new town named Kartarpur ("Creator's town") in the region called the Punjab, and presently split between India and Pakistan. There he gathered a group of families that did farming for sustenance. Over time, this community evolved into a world religion with twenty-five million adherents scattered around the globe. In his compositions, Nanak sang of God who brought the creation into being and oversees its activity with great degree of concern. Nanak expected human beings to be in constant awareness of divine immanence around them, and as a result live a life of personal purity, hard work, and social productivity. As the Sikh community expanded they came into conflict with the Mughal rulers of the time, and this confrontation eventually resulted in the Sikhs establishing their own rule in the Punjab."</p>	This edit conflicts with another submission.	No
------	---------------	-----------------------------	---	--	----

This suggested edit should remain. There is nothing controversial about it. Since the intent of the edit is to describe Sikhism, it is not necessary to speak of persecution of Hindus at this point if that is what caused it to be rejected.